

Trustees of Boise State University
Trustees of Idaho State University
Trustees of Lewis-Clark State College
Board of Regents of the University of Idaho
State Board for Career Technical Education

STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION
December 19-20, 2018
Hosted by College of Western Idaho
AT
Boise State University
Student Union Building
Simplot Ballroom
Boise, Idaho

A regularly scheduled meeting of the State Board of Education was hosted by the College of Western Idaho December 19-20, 2018 at Boise State University in Boise, Idaho. Board President Dr. Linda Clark called the meeting to order at 10:30 am (MST).

## **Present:**

Linda Clark, President Debbie Critchfield\*, Vice President David Hill, Secretary Emma Atchley Andrew Scoggin
Don Soltman
Richard Westerberg\*
Sherri Ybarra, State Superintendent

\*(Except where Noted)

# Wednesday, December 19, 2018

#### **BOARDWORK**

A. Agenda Review/Approval

#### **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Critchfield/Hill): To approve the agenda as submitted. The motion carried 8-0.

B. Minutes Review / Approval

## **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Critchfield/Hill): To approve the minutes from the October 17-18, 2018 Regular Board meeting and the November 8, 2018 Special Board meeting as submitted. The motion carried 8-0.

C. Rolling Calendar

#### **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Critchfield/Hill): To set December 18-19, 2019 as the date and the College of Southern Idaho as the location for the December 2019 regularly scheduled Board meeting. The motion carried 8-0.

# PLANNING, POLICY AND GOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS (PPGA)

1. College of Western Idaho Biennial Progress Report
This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Planning, Policy and Governmental Affairs (PPGA) Committee Chair, Mr. Don Soltman, introduced the item and then invited College of Western Idaho (CWI) President, Dr. Bert Glandon, to present his biennial update to the Board.

Dr. Glandon reported CWI received independent accreditation through the Northwest Commission on Colleges and Universities (NWCCU) in April of 2017 and then provided an update to the Board on the six objectives of CWI's Strategic Plan. Dr. Glandon then shared with the Board that to date CWI is serving less than 3.00% of its current population, compared to a typical community college that will serve approximately 7.0% of their local community, and this has created a huge potential for growth in order to achieve normal delivery to the local community.

Enrollment of dual credit students at CWI continues to grow and exceed career technical education and academic affairs and CWI is developing new modes of delivery for instructional programs, in partnership with industry, that are responsive to the local workforce needs and needs of the students.

Board member Soltman asked if CWI's noncredit student population, 12,035 for FY18, could be counted in the Board's 60% Goal. Dr. Glandon responded CWI is working with NWCCU to develop stackable certificate programs that are responsive to industry needs and transferrable to career technical education programs.

Finally, Dr. Glandon reported securing adequate facilities to serve students is one of CWI's largest challenges and in response to this need, CWI will be installing modular buildings on the Nampa campus in the spring of 2019 and must renew leased buildings to continue serving students in Ada County.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

2. Workforce Development Council Update This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Planning, Policy and Governmental Affairs (PPGA) Committee Chair, Mr. Don Soltman, introduced the item and shared with Board members the purpose of the agenda item was to generate a discussion around areas of collaboration between the Workforce Development Council (WDC) and the State Board of Education.

Representing the Workforce Development Council were Mr. Trent Clark, Chair, Ms. B.J. Swanson, Vice Chair, Mr. Jeff McCray, Mr. Joe Maloney, Mr. John Young, Ms. Deni Hoehne and Ms. Wendi Secrist, Executive Director for the Workforce Development Council.

Mr. Clark opened the discussion by thanking members of the Board for their collaboration with the Workforce Development Council on the Idaho Opportunity Scholarship for Adult He then continued the discussion by stressing the need for extended educational opportunities into the workplace, also known as work based learning. The WDC has found the largest barrier to work based learning has been the inability for skills learned in the workplace to be counted or stacked towards earning a higher degree. Mr. Maloney added there are many different pathways to a career and stressed the need for a change in the system to recognize the different pathways to a degree. Finally, Mr. Clark shared the difficulties with utilizing Idaho's Advanced Opportunities program for Career Technical Education programs.

Ms. Secrist asked the Board to share their legislative priorities for the 2019 Legislative session and how the WDC could be of assistance. Board member Clark responded Outcomes Based Funding (OBF) is the singular item the Board is taking legislative action on, however, later in the agenda the Board will be hearing a report from the consulting firm Huron on ways to consolidate services across the public institutions and as a result the Board may take additional action.

Board member Atchley then reiterated her personal concern with the idea of the only goal of education being a job or career. She added there are other values to education far beyond a career and the Board should not lose focus on these benefits. At the time the Board recessed for lunch and returned at 1:00pm MST.

## WORKSESSION

## PLANNING, POLICY & GOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS

## A. K-20 Education Strategic Plan

This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Planning, Policy and Governmental Affairs (PPGA) Committee Chair, Mr. Don Soltman, introduced the work session item reminding Board members during the October 2018 Regular Board Meeting the Board reviewed the performance of Idaho's K-20 education system through the review of progress towards the benchmarks and performance targets of the K-20 Education Strategic Plan. As part of this conversation, the Board gave feedback to staff on amendments to the K-20 Strategic Plan, asking that a number of performance measures be removed. The discussion also included bringing back information to inform a discussion on reframing the Board's definition of certificate as it is used for determining progress toward the Board's education attainment goal and establishing annual credential targets, by level and by institution to meet the Board's population goal of 60% of Idahoans (ages 25-34) who have a college degree or certificate requiring one academic year or more of study ("60% Goal").

Prior to the discussion around the "60% Goal", the Board's Chief Planning and Policy Officer, Ms. Tracie Bent shared with Board members that depending on the discussion outcome, the redline version of the strategic plan in the agenda materials would be amended and then come back to the Board for approval at the February 2019 Regular Board meeting. Additionally, Ms. Bent reminded Board members of the difference between a production goal and a population goal and part of the conversation around using production for meeting a population goal should include all of those other factors the education system does not touch. Ms. Bent reminded Board members that when the Board originally set the "60% Goal" there were many discussions around the state about what the workforce need really was and how policy makers wanted Idaho to grow. In making workforce need projections it is important to understand the methodology behind the projections and pick a methodology that aligns with the Board's policy direction. If the Board would like to explore resetting the percentages of each education level there should be some consensus on the end outcome the Board would like to achieve: a workforce that meets the state's current occupational needs, or one that aligns with Idaho's Department of Commerce work and takes into consideration the types of businesses and industry they are trying to attract to Idaho, or one that looks at growing a workforce that meets the needs for those industries that are most likely to grow Idaho's economy. Finally, Ms. Bent reported the Instruction, Research and Student Affairs (IRSA) Committee is working on a definition for micro-credentials and badging that will come to the Board, through Board policy, for approval at a future meeting.

The Board's Chief Research Officer, Dr. Cathleen McHugh then updated the Board on the assumptions used to determine the current and projected composition and shortfall of credential production that would be needed to help meet the "60% Educational Attainment Goal".

- 1. Estimate of the population of those age 25 to 34 in 2025 came from the Department of Labor;
- 2. Attainment between credentials would be the same in 2025 as is today;
- 3. Composition of the "60% Goal" would remain the same in 2025 as is today;
- 4. Definition of a credential is based on the definition of one academic year of nine (9) months or more.

Dr. McHugh reported Idaho's public institutions are responsible for 65% of Associate degrees and 59% of Bachelor's degrees awarded in Idaho and that the growth in graduates over the last 8 years for Associate degrees has been 3.4% and 1.6% for Bachelor's degrees. If growth is to continue at the current rate, the Board will reach the Education Attainment Goal for Associate Degrees in 2029 and 2036 for Bachelor's Degrees. A production rate of 8% per year would be necessary for the Board to meet the "60% Goal" for Bachelor's Degrees by 2025.

Board member Hill then asked if the data is accurately capturing the number of individuals with some education who go on to secure meaningful jobs, adding that from 2010 to the present the job market did not turn out as expected with a large number of middle class jobs having been created, and the difficulty of counting certificates may be misleading the Board on progress towards achieving the "60% Goal" and the goal of the Board should be to figure out how to capture the information. Ms. Bent then asked if members of the Board would be interested in having Board staff prepare a new analysis based upon the current Idaho job market projections and projections based on what Idaho could aspire to be. Dr. Hill responded in the affirmative.

Board member Westerberg commented in 2010 the Board adopted a goal ("60% Goal") that would prepare the workforce in Idaho for the jobs needed in 2020 and will the jobs in 2025 require different skills and levels of education than those of 2020. Additionally, Mr. Westerberg added the Board must also determine how to count certificates and at what point in time do stackable badges or credentials become a marketable skill that can be measured. The Board's Executive Director, Mr. Matt Freeman, added when the "60%" Goal" was established, the intent was for 60% of the population (aged 25-34) to have some form of postsecondary degree or certificate of one academic year or more. This did not mean the other 40% were to be uneducated and certificates of less than one year are included in this population (40%). Ms. Bent commented that depending on the goal it may be a heavy lift to achieve without a significant increase in resources for the public postsecondary institutions and it may be worth a conversation by the Board to identify a path forward for what the Board can do to advocate for these additional resources.

5

Mr. Freeman commented another area of guidance that would be helpful for Board staff would be if the Board would like to continue to use a population based goal knowing a population goal is routinely conflated with the degree attainment goal. Dr. Hill responded with a desire for a production goal that is consistent with a population goal, adding production is something the Board and institutions are accountable for. Mr. Westerberg commented on the importance for the Board to recognize the discussion is not about realigning the goal posts, but determining the workforce needs for 2025 and finding the most reasonable mechanism to meet these needs.

Board member Scoggin asked why the Board's K-12 goals are not included in the Board's K-20 Strategic Plan. Ms. Bent responded as the Board reviews the plan from year to year the goals have fluctuated as the Board's focus has changed. Over the past two years most of the K-12 specific goals were removed to focus on the outcomes at the end of the pipeline. The reorganization of the Board's Strategic Plan in 2018 focused on reducing the number of objectives and performance measures to be more specific to the pipeline. It would be a discussion for the Board to determine if the goal is for the Board's Strategic Plan to measure individual parts of the pipeline or to have fewer goals focusing on the end of the pipeline. Mr. Scoggin responded if the Board has a desire for K-12 students to be prepared for postsecondary education then some of the Board's attention should focus on the Board's K-12 goals. Dr. Clark commented if the Board is to ever make an impact on the measures, then they must have strategies in place on how to improve school readiness and make sure all students have an opportunity to take advantage of their education.

One half of students come to school not ready to learn and spend most of their K-12 career trying to catch up. If the Board is ever going to have an impact on the performance measures, then the Board must deal with this and have some strategies on how to improve school readiness and make sure students have the opportunity to take advantage of their education. The Board's Strategic Plan, Goal 2: Educational Attainment should be divided into two parts; articulating the Board's goals for K-12 education and articulating the Board's goals for the public colleges and universities.

Board member Atchley expressed her frustration with measuring the work of the public postsecondary institutions without paying attention to the results. The Board cannot continue to measure what students are learning during their K-12 career without having higher expectations for the outcomes. Ms. Bent asked if it were the desire of the Board for staff to prepare options for objectives and performance measures for the Board to consider at the February 2019 Regular Board meeting. There were no objections from the Board.

In addition to the work on the strategic plan, performance measures and "60% Goal" production targets, this agenda item included the annual dual credit report, annual state scholarship report, and annual remediation report.

The Board's Principal Research Analyst, Mr. Bill Laude, shared with the Board the annual Dual Credit Report where he reported a significant increase in the volume of students

enrolled in dual credit and the number of credits accumulated and the Board can expect to begin to see a higher number of students with dual credit than not. Additionally, the number of Associates Degrees being awarded by high schools has increased over the last three years. A copy of the full report has been included in the agenda materials. Dr. Hill asked if the relative performance of students continuing on to a postsecondary education is negative because dual credit is penetrating deeper into the overall student population to which Mr. Laude responded in the affirmative.

Mr. Laude then presented the annual State Scholarship Report where he reported the rate of accepted awards had remained constant until FY17 when there was a significant increase in funding and the award ratios for FY19 are what the Board can expect to see based upon the normal attrition rates for scholarship recipients. In evaluating the diversity of the applicant pool over a four year period (FY16 – FY19) minority populations have displayed significant increases in their representation in the applicant pool, with the Hispanic population exhibiting a 236% increase in volume, and a 191% increase in Ranked, Eligible Applicants. From FY16 through FY19, the number of ranked applicants increased significantly across all geographic locales with the greatest number of awards going to students from rural areas. Finally, Mr. Laude reported there is a strong correlation between a student's high school grade point average (GPA) and the likelihood they will successfully persist in the scholarship program. A copy of the full report has been included in the agenda materials.

Finally, Mr. Laude presented the annual Remediation Report where he reported one of the initial findings for the first-time full-time population of degree seeking students, 50% enrolled at the 2-year colleges are taking math remediation courses and 20%-25% enrolled at the 4-year college and universities are taking remediation courses based upon a student's course taking behavior. Additionally, Mr. Laude reported when evaluating trends in persistence, the general student population return rate is approximately 50% for students attending a 2-year college and approximately 66% for students attending a 4year college and universities. The return rate at the 2-year colleges for students taking remediation is 48% for math and 42% for English within community colleges and for the 4-year colleges, 59% for math and 52% for English. A copy of the full report has been included in the agenda materials. Board member Soltman asked if all of the institutions are using the same math remediation model to which Mr. Laude responded in the negative. Mr. Soltman then asked if there is a reason for the Board to be prescriptive in the remediation model to which Mr. Laude responded there are several models currently in place at the institutions that Board staff can evaluate over time. Ms. Bent added Board policy limits remediation models to the Accelerated, Corequisite or Emporium models.

The final item for the Work Session agenda was a preview of the Board's Postsecondary Data Dashboard which can be found on the Idaho State Board of Education's website. At the conclusion of the Postsecondary Dashboard presentation, Dr. McHugh shared with Board members a preview of the Transition Dashboard that will include metrics for the Go-On Rate, Direct Admissions and Scholarship awards. Board member Scoggin asked when the Transition Dashboard would be ready for final distribution to which Dr. McHugh responded mid-January.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

The Board then recessed for 20 minutes, returning at 2:50pm MST.

## INSTRUCTION, RESEARCH AND STUDENT AFFAIRS

# B. Complete College America Momentum Pathways Planning

This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Instruction, Research and Student Affairs (IRSA) Committee chair, Ms. Debbie Critchfield, introduced the item and then invited the Board's Chief Academic Officer, Dr. Randall Brumfield, to share the Complete College America (CCA) work plan with the Board.

Dr. Brumfield reported the purpose of the CCA work plan was to assist institutions with prioritizing and implementing the Complete College America Game Changers adopted by the Board. After discussing each of the goals, the Board determined Goal 2: Increase Timely Degree Completion and Goal 5: Increase Return-to-College and Completion for Adults as high priority to be implemented by fall 2021.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

## STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION (SDE)

1. Developments in K-12 Education
This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

State Superintendent of Public Instruction, Sherri Ybarra reported to the Board the State Department of Education's legislative agenda included expanding pilots for mastery based education, a teacher pipeline initiative to address the state's teacher shortage, and expanding the Advanced Opportunities program to include Career Technical Education courses.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

2. School, District and State Report Card Release
This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

State Superintendent of Public Instruction, Ms. Sherri Ybarra, introduced the item and then invited the Director of Assessment and Accountability for the State Department of Education, Ms. Karlynn Laraway, to provide a demonstration of the newly designed state and school report card.

At the conclusion of the demonstration, Board member Scoggin asked if the Board's Data Dashboard should be embedded with the report card presented today to which Dr. Clark

responded the intent is for the state and school report card to be linked to the Board's Data Dashboard.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

3. Idaho Reading Indicator Update This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

State Superintendent of Public Instruction, Ms. Sherri Ybarra, introduced the item and then invited the Director of Assessment and Accountability for the State Department of Education, Ms. Karlynn Laraway, to provide the results for the fall 2018 Idaho Reading Indicator (IRI) Assessment.

Ms. Laraway reported the new Istation Early Reading Assessment (ISIP ER) was administered to 87,929 students in fall 2018 for the first time to students in grades Kindergarten through Grade 3. The statewide results for all students show 52.3% were at grade level, 24.07% were near grade level and 23.40% were below grade level. When viewed by grade level, less than half of Kindergarten and Grade 1 students, statewide, were at grade level, compared to approximately 60% of Grade 2 and Grade 3 students at grade level.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

4. Parent and Staff Engagement and Satisfaction Survey

#### **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Ybarra/Critchfield): I move to approve the parent and staff survey items as presented in Attachments 2 and 3 and to administer the parent and staff surveys beginning in the 2018-2019 school year. The motion carried 8-0.

State Superintendent of Public Instruction, Ms. Sherri Ybarra, introduced the item and then invited the Director of Assessment and Accountability for the State Department of Education, Ms. Karlynn Laraway, to update the Board with the final questions for the parent and staff surveys.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

5. Annexation/Excision Request – Fremont County School District (#215)/Sugar-Salem School District (#322)

## **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Ybarra/Hill): To accept the recommendation of the hearing officer and to deny the petition for excision and annexation of property from Freemont County School District 215 to Sugar-Salem School District 322. The motion carried 8-0.

State Superintendent of Public Instruction, Ms. Sherri Ybarra, introduced the item and reminded Board members should the recommendation of the hearing officer be accepted, the petition for annexation from Fremont County School District 215 to Sugar-Salem School District 322 will be denied.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

6. Professional Standards Commission Annual Report 2017-2018

## **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Ybarra/Critchfield): To accept the Professional Standards Commission 2017-2018 Annual Report as submitted in Attachment 2. The motion carried 8-0.

State Superintendent of Public Instruction, Ms. Sherri Ybarra, introduced the item and then invited the Director of Certification and Professional Standards for the State Department of Education, Ms. Lisa Colon-Durham, to provide the Professional Standards Commission 2017-2018 Annual Report to the Board.

Ms. Colon-Durham reported that for the 2017-2018 school year, the number of alternative authorizations issued continues to increase, as well as an increase in inappropriate conduct with students and substance abuse.

Board President Clark commented on the increase in the number of educators seeking certification through an alternate route and asked how these individuals know the type of certification needed to fill certain positions. Ms. Colon-Durham responded the State Department of Education (SDE) is reaching out to these individuals through career fairs in partnership with the Department of Labor, direct communication between the school districts and SDE staff, and also through an increased effort by SDE staff to attend the states regional superintendent meetings to distribute information and answer questions.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

At this time Board members moved to go in to Executive Session.

## **EXECUTIVE SESSION (Closed to the Public)**

M/S (Critchfield/Hill): To meet in executive session pursuant to Section 74-206(1)(d), Idaho Code, "to consider records that are exempt from disclosure as provided in Chapter 1, Title 74, Idaho Code." and to meet in executive session pursuant to Section 74-206(1)(c), Idaho Code, "to discuss acquiring an interest in real property which is not owned by a public agency". A roll call vote was taken and the motion carried 8-0.

Board members entered in to Executive Session at 4:17 pm (MST).

M/S (Critchfield/Hill): To go out of Executive Session. The motion carried 8-0.

http://www.boardofed.idaho.gov/

Board members exited Execution Session at 5:04pm (MST) when they recessed for the evening.

Thursday, December 20, 2018 8:00 a.m. (MST), College of Western Idaho, at Boise State University, Student Union Building – Simplot Ballroom, Boise, Idaho.

Board President Dr. Linda Clark called the meeting to order at 8:00am (MST) for regularly scheduled business. There were four (4) participants for Open Forum.

#### OPEN FORUM

Mr. Ladd Edmo, Vice-Chairman of the Shoshone-Bannock Tribes Fort Hall Business Council, Mr. Timothy Haskett, Shoshone-Bannock Tribes Scholarship Recipient, Ms. Yvonne Warjack, Shoshone-Bannock Tribes Scholarship Recipient and Dr. Larry Murillo, Shoshone-Bannock Tribes 477 EET Program Director addressed the Board to encourage Board members to approve the proposed amendment to Board policy Section V.R.3.,a. to lower tuition for American Indian students effective for the 2019-2020 academic year.

#### **CONSENT AGENDA**

#### **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Critchfield/Soltman): To approve the consent agenda as presented. The motion carried 8-0.

# Business Affairs & Human Resources (BAHR) - Section II Finance

 Boise State University – Conveyance of Easement to Ada County Highway District

### **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Critchfield/Soltman): By unanimous consent to approve the request by Boise State University to grant an easement to the Ada County Highway District (ACHD) in Dona Larsen Park for the purpose of creating a pedestrian pathway in substantial conformance with the attached agreement. The motion carried 8-0.

2. University of Idaho – Sublease at the Idaho Water Center with United HealthCare Services, Inc.

### **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Critchfield/Soltman): By unanimous consent to approve the sublease between the Board of Regents of the University of Idaho and United HealthCare Services, Inc. in substantial conformance to the form submitted to the Board in Attachment 1 and to authorize the University's Vice President for Finance and Administration to execute the Sublease and any related transactional documents. The motion carried 8-0.

3. University of Idaho – Request for Approval to Construct West Campus Utilities Improvements

## **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Critchfield/Soltman): To approve the request by the University of Idaho to implement the bid, award and construction phases of a Capital Project to construct a proposed West Campus Utilities Distribution Systems and Infrastructure Improvements and Expansion, Phase One, on the main campus of the University of Idaho, Moscow, Idaho for a total cost of \$3,500,000, as described in the materials submitted to the Board. Authorization includes the authority to execute all necessary and requisite consulting and vendor contracts to fully implement the bid award and construction phases of the project. The motion carried 8-0.

# Planning, Policy and Governmental Affairs (PPGA)

- 4. Institution President Approved Alcohol Permits

  This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.
- Lewis-Clark State College Facilities Naming Career Technical Education Center – "Schweitzer Career & Technical Education Center"

#### **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Critchfield/Soltman): By unanimous consent to approve the request by Lewis-Clark State College to name the future Career Technical Education Facility the "Schweitzer Career & Technical Education Center". The motion carried 8-0.

## State Department of Education (SDE)

6. Professional Standards Commission – Emergency Provisional Certificates

## **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Critchfield/Soltman): By unanimous consent to approve the request by the Professional Standards Commission for the one-year emergency provisional certificates for Michelle Chung, Carie Brackenbury, Grace Campos, Erin Ramirez, Ana Carpenter, Kayla Martens, Kodette Parkins-Hansen, Chris Perrigot, Cami Pratt, Linsey Bair, Amanda Bishop, Diana Cayler, Jared Sene, Mikalynn Amos, Mari Nelson, Alyson Sauer, Hannah Ziegler, Paul Henderson, Hannah Meyerhoeffer, Marika Clough, Lonnie Funkhouser and Kirstin Wert to teach the content area and grade ranges at the specified school districts as provided herein for the 2018-2019 school year. The motion carried 8-0.

#### **AUDIT**

1. College and University FY2018 Audit Findings Reported by the Idaho State Board of Education's External Auditor

## **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Scoggin/Westerberg): To accept from the Audit Committee the Fiscal Year 2018 Financial Audit Reports for Boise State University, Idaho State University, University of Idaho, Lewis-Clark State College, and Eastern Idaho Technical College, as submitted by Moss Adams, LLP in Attachment 1. The motion carried 8-0.

Audit Committee Chair, Mr. Andrew Scoggin, introduced the item and then invited the Board's Chief Fiscal Officer, Dr. Carson Howell, to provide an overview of the report findings to the Board.

Dr. Howell reported the Board has contracted with Moss Adams LLP, an independent certified public accounting firm, to conduct the annual financial audits of Boise State University, Idaho State University, University of Idaho, Lewis-Clark State College, and Eastern Idaho Technical College. The financial audits for FY2018 were conducted in accordance with Generally Accepted Government Auditing Standards and include an auditor's opinion on the basic financial statements prepared by each of the five institutions. There was one significant deficiency for Eastern Idaho Technical College related to federal Student Financial Assistance. For University of Idaho there was one material weakness identified for lack of adequate accounting controls over library materials and a significant deficiency in internal controls over major federal programs. All of the findings have since been addressed.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

2. FY2018 College and Universities' Financial Ratios
This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Audit Committee Chair, Mr. Andrew Scoggin, introduced the item and then invited the Board's Chief Fiscal Officer, Dr. Carson Howell, to provide an overview of the FY2018 College and Universities' Financial Ratios to the Board.

Dr. Howell reported the ratios presented measure the financial health of each institution and include a Composite Financial Index based on four key ratios designed to measure financial activity and key trends within an institution over time.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

3. FY2018 College and Universities' Unrestricted Net Position Balances This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Audit Committee Chair, Mr. Andrew Scoggin, introduced the item and then invited the Board's Chief Fiscal Officer, Dr. Carson Howell, to provide an overview of the FY2018 College and Universities' Unrestricted Net Position Balances to the Board.

Dr. Howell reported the net position balances provide a tool to gauge the amount and types of assets held by an institution. An analysis of unrestricted expendable assets provides insights into some of the reserves which might be available in order for an institution to meet emergency needs. The volatility of state funding as well as fluctuations in enrolment and tuition revenue necessitates that institutions maintain fund balances sufficient to stabilize their operating budgets. Board Policy V.B. sets a minimum target reserve of 5%. Idaho State University and Lewis-Clark State College met the Board's 5% reserve target in FY2018. Boise State University's commitments against unrestricted net position indicates that net position available for emergencies is 3.75%. The University of Idaho reported a negative \$6.6 million for its unrestricted available net position, which results in a negative ratio of 1.6% unrestricted available net position for FY2018 operating expenses.

Board member Soltman asked for the University of Idaho (UI) if the GASB Standards 74/75 for the University's Other Post-Employment Benefits (OPEB) liability for its retiree health and life insurance benefits was a one-time expenditure or an ongoing liability. Vice President for Finance and Administration for the University of Idaho, Mr. Brian Foisy, responded UI expects for this liability to be a one-time expenditure. Board member Scoggin asked UI if there are any strategic moves or plans in place to respond to the operating deficit. Mr. Foisy responded UI will take one-time and base budget reductions, primarily in the General Education Fund, in the coming fiscal year to address the three major items contributing to the negative unrestricted net position balance; the underlying net operating loss of \$21 million, GASB Standards change of \$35 million, and the fringe benefit rate.

Board member Hill asked if the operating deficit was due to enrollment being below expectation or unexpected costs that will continue to affect the University's position. Mr. Foisy responded both and in response UI shared with the campus community the current budget was not viable and a new model would be developed.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

# BUSINESS AFFAIRS AND HUMAN RESOURCES (BAHR)

#### Section I – Human Resources

1. Board Policy II.H. - Coaches and Athletic Directors - First Reading

#### **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Atchley/Critchfield): To approve the amendments to the single-year and multiyear model contracts for coaches as presented in Attachments 2 and 3. The motion carried 8-0.

#### AND

M/S (Atchley/Hill): To approve the first reading of Board Governing Policy and Procedures II.H., Coaches and Athletic Directors, as presented in Attachment 1. The motion carried 8-0.

Business Affairs and Human Resources (BAHR) Committee Chair, Ms. Emma Atchley introduced the item sharing with Board members the proposed changes to Board Policy II.H. updates the Board approved model contract for coaches. Board member Westerberg commented the proposed policy changes have been well drafted and include liquidated damage advice to the institutions that have been well structured, however, the BAHR committee has reviewed contracts over the last two (2) months with liquidated damages well below benchmarks for their conferences. Mr. Westerberg then requested unanimous consent for the Athletic Committee to look at the issue of liquidated damages and meet with the institutions to address these concerns prior to the second reading of the policy. There were no objections.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

2. Boise State University – Amendment to Multi-Year Contract for Gordon Presnell, – Head Women's Basketball Coach

## **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Atchley/Critchfield): To approve the request by Boise State University to amend the multi-year agreement with Gordon Presnell, Head Women's Basketball Coach with a term from August 13, 2017 and terminating March 31, 2022, as proposed in Attachment 1. The motion carried 8-0.

Business Affairs and Human Resources (BAHR) Committee Chair, Ms. Emma Atchley, introduced the item and shared with Board members the salary from the current contract is unchanged, however the incentive structure changed and now requires Board approval.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

## Section II - Finance

1. Board Policy V.R. – Establishment of Fees – Second Reading

## **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (--/--): To approve the second reading of the proposed amendment to Board policy V.R., Establishment of Fees, as presented in Attachment 1. This item was returned to the Business Affairs and Human Resources Committee for further review and analysis. No action was taken by the Board.

Business Affairs and Human Resources (BAHR) Committee Chair, Ms. Emma Atchley, introduced the item, and shared with the Board the BAHR Committee's conclusion the item needed further review and analysis and requested unanimous consent to return the item to the BAHR Committee. There were no objections.

2. Program Prioritization Update This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Business Affairs and Human Resources (BAHR) Committee Chair, Ms. Emma Atchley, introduced the item and shared with Board members program prioritization was implemented by the Board in 2013. The annual updates provide the Board with assurances of consistency and the institutions with a process to objectively review program efficiency and effectiveness.

The Board's Chief Fiscal Officer, Dr. Carson Howell, reminded Board members the annual request for program prioritization is currently within Board Policy V.B. and is it the preference of the Board to keep program prioritization under Board Policy V.B. or to align the annual request with the program approval process under Board Policy III.

The Board requested, by unanimous consent, a change in Board policy to move Program Prioritization to Board Policy III.

3. Dual Credit Cost Study This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Business Affairs and Human Resources (BAHR) Committee Chair, Ms. Emma Atchley, introduced the item and shared with Board members the purpose of the study was to inform the Board on the actual costs of dual credit. She then invited the Board's Chief Fiscal Officer, Dr. Carson Howell, to share the results of the cost study with the Board.

Dr. Howell reported Board staff, in consultation with the institutions, developed a common methodology to evaluate the costs at each institution. Based on the methodology developed, the institutions experienced a range of net revenue/cost for dual credit. Before indirect expenses the range is from a net gain of \$35.68 per credit hour to a net loss of \$3.00 per credit hour, and after indirect expenses the range is from a net gain of \$12.18

per credit hour to a net loss of \$47.66 per credit hour. The Board expressed a desire for Board staff and institutions to explore ways for dual credit offerings to be more consistent and uniform across the institutions, high schools, and dual credit offerings and to return to the Board with a recommendation for the dual credit fee.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

4. FY2020 Permanent Building Fund Advisory Council Recommendations This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Business Affairs and Human Resources (BAHR) Committee Chair, Ms. Emma Atchley, introduced the item and shared with the Board the Permanent Building Fund Advisory Council (PBFAC) FY2020 recommendations for higher education conform to the Governor's emphasis on deferred maintenance and that none of the Permanent Building Fund (PBF) requests by the colleges and universities for capital projects were recommended for PBF support.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

5. Idaho State University – Funding and Construction of Phase I of the EAMES Building Remodel Project

#### **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Atchley/Critchfield): To approve Idaho State University's request, pending JFAC approval, to reallocate the \$10M dollars of funding from Gale Life Sciences to the EAMES project, and to allow Idaho State University to begin construction of Phase I of the EAMES Building remodel for moving College of Technology programs at a total project cost not to exceed \$13.3M. The motion carried 8-0.

Business Affairs and Human Resources (BAHR) Committee Chair, Ms. Emma Atchley, introduced the item and then invited Idaho State University (ISU) Interim Vice President for Finance, Mr. Brian Hickenlooper, to provide an overview of the request to the Board.

Mr. Hickenlooper reported the request before the Board was to approve moving the \$10M dollars appropriated for the Gale Life Science building remodel, and \$3.3M of institutional funds from reserves, to the remodel of the EAMES Building. After the appropriation for the Gale Life Science building remodel was received, the estimate from the contractor to complete the renovation was significantly higher than the appropriation received. Approval of this request would provide for collocation of several College of Technology programs in one building.

Board member Scoggin asked if Idaho State University had a long term plan for the Gale Life Sciences building. Mr. Hickenlooper responded further assessment of the building is needed to see what upgrades would be required, however, ISU still needs the facility to provide services for students.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

6. Idaho State University – Interim Master Plan – Idaho Falls Campus

#### **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Atchley/Hill): To approve the Interim Master Plan for Idaho State University's Idaho Falls Campus as proposed in Attachment 2. The motion carried 8-0.

Business Affairs and Human Resources (BAHR) Committee Chair, Ms. Emma Atchley, introduced the item and then invited Idaho State University (ISU) President, Mr. Kevin Satterlee, to provide an overview of the request to the Board.

President Satterlee reported ISU has worked closely with the University of Idaho, the City of Idaho Falls, the Idaho National Laboratory (INL) and members of the Idaho Congressional Delegation the legislature to develop a more meaningful connection between Idaho State University/University of Idaho Higher Education Center campus with the Idaho National Laboratory.

Board member Hill expressed his approval of the plan and the integration of the INL with ISU and UI and the benefit this will have for the local community. Dr. Hill then asked if there is a possibility for incubating a business park as part of the master plan. President Satterlee confirmed there is a plan for a business park on the site and is provided for in the master plan developed by INL. He added the ISU Foundation owns a single parcel of land to the north that could be utilized for a higher education purpose in the middle of the INL site.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

7. Huron Consulting Report This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

This was a time certain item on the agenda for 1:00pm MST.

Business Affairs and Human Resources (BAHR) Committee Chair, Ms. Emma Atchley, introduced the item and reminded Board members of the recommendation from the Governor's Higher Education Task Force to drive efficiencies, cost savings, and a higher level of service in back office functions by migrating from the current federated system of institutions to a more integrated, centralized and student-centric System. During the 2018 legislative session, \$250,000 was appropriated to fund a study to identify potential areas of improvement and provide recommendations on strategies to accomplish this recommendation. Huron Consulting was selected through a competitive bid process and presented to the Board the strategies and potential savings and efficiencies identified through their analysis. Representing Huron Consulting were Mark Finlan, Jonathon Krasnov and Jeff Leinbach. A copy of the full report has been included in the agenda materials.

Huron Consulting identified a series of options and foundational decisions that would first need to be made prior to implementation of the potential efficiencies identified in the report. The report focused on three areas: labor duplication/fragmentation/span of control, purchasing power, and IT enterprise systems and their findings consisted of:

- 1. Near-Term Opportunities
  - a. Optimized mid-level management span of control. Across all institutions, 60% to 70% of supervisors have three or fewer direct reports.
  - b. Optimize staff support in functional areas (Finance, HR, Research and IT), and consolidate generalist staff.
- 2. Intermediate-Term Opportunities
  - a. Procurement: Negotiate vendor agreements/contracts across institutions and implement eProcurement system housing shared catalogs for jointly negotiated pricing and contracts. Areas for highest savings are administrative (e.g. office supplies), scientific/medical supplies and facilities.
  - Self-Insurance: Migrate all institutions to shared self-insurance for health insurance.
- 3. Long-Term Opportunities
  - a. Centralize selected functional support staff (Finance, HR, IT and Research Administration)
  - b. Converge into single ERP environment (two or three of the institutions likely need to upgrade to cloud-based platforms within the next 2-5 years).

At the end of the presentation the Board engaged in a discussion around how to prioritize the recommendations and proceed with the next steps.

At this time the Board recessed for 15 minutes, returning at 2:45pm MST.

## INSTRUCTION, RESEARCH, AND STUDENT AFFAIRS (IRSA)

1. Standing Committee Report – Higher Education Task Force Update This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Instruction, Research and Student Affairs (IRSA) Committee Chair, Ms. Debbie Critchfield introduced the item and reported the IRSA Committee continues to work on several key initiatives in cooperation with staff from the eight public higher education institutions and other educational state agencies.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

2. Northwest Commission on Colleges and Universities (NWCCU) This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

This was a time certain item on the agenda for 11:30am MST.

Instruction, Research and Student Affairs (IRSA) Committee Chair, Ms. Debbie Critchfield introduced the item and invited Dr. Sonny Ramaswamy, Northwest Commission on Colleges and Universities (NWCCU) President and Ms. Valerie Martinez, NWCCU Vice President to provide an overview of the NWCCU accreditation process to the Board.

The Board recessed for lunch, returning at 1:00pm MST.

3. Boise State University – Doctor of Philosophy, Biomedical Engineering

#### **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Critchfield/Hill): To approve the request by Boise State University to create a new academic program that will award a Ph.D. in Biomedical Engineering as **presented.** The motion carried 8-0.

Instruction, Research and Student Affairs (IRSA) Committee Chair, Ms. Debbie Critchfield introduced the proposal from Boise State University (BSU) to create a new interdisciplinary program that will award a Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D.) in Biomedical Engineering.

Board member Westerberg commented both the University of Idaho (UI) and Idaho State University (ISU) offer similar programs and asked what effect the proposal from BSU will have on these programs. Interim Provost for Boise State University (BSU), Dr. Tony Roark responded the proposed program has been designed to be complimentary to and enhance the programs at ISU and UI. Board member Hill added the IRSA Committee did review the program proposal and found it to complimentary to the existing programs at UI and ISU, however, going forward, Dr. Hill requests BSU, ISU and UI work together to develop a coordinated approach for these types of programs that will recognize the specific capabilities and ambitions of each institution.

Board member Atchley expressed her concern with BSU's enrollment projection for the proposed program, adding it has not been uncommon for institutions to overestimate program enrollment and asks what action BSU will take if the program's enrollment does not support the cost. Dr. Roark responded a sunset clause has been built into the proposal and will be utilized should actual enrollment not meet projected enrollment. Mr. Westerberg added Idaho is a resource short state and advanced programs such as the proposed Ph.D. in Biomedical Engineering, must be fully vetted by the Council on Academic Affairs and Programs (CAAP) and IRSA Committee to insure the program fits into the state's view of education.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

4. Idaho State University – Master of Arts in Spanish

## **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Critchfield/Westerberg): To approve the request by Idaho State University to create an online. Master of Arts in Spanish as presented in Attachment 1. The motion carried 8-0.

#### AND

M/S (Critchfield/Westerberg): To approve the request by Idaho State University to designate an online program fee for the Master of Arts in Spanish in the amount of \$330 per credit in conformance with the program budget submitted to the Board in Attachment 1. The motion carried 8-0.

Instruction, Research and Student Affairs (IRSA) Committee Chair, Ms. Debbie Critchfield introduced the proposal from Idaho State University (ISU) for a new online Master of Arts (MA) in Spanish that would operate under the guidelines of Board Policy V.R. as it pertains to wholly online programs. She then invited Executive Vice President and Provost for Idaho State University, Dr. Laura Woodworth-Ney, to present the proposal to the Board.

Dr. Woodworth-Nye reported the proposed MA in Spanish has been designed to help address a shortage of teachers qualified to teach dual credit Spanish and is structured to be a part-time program at a significantly reduced cost over the normal credit hour cost for graduate level programs and is not a self-support program. Mr. Westerberg asked if ISU has included a sunset clause in the proposal if projected enrollment is not met. Dr. Woodworth-Nye responded in the affirmative, adding if enrollment projects are not met. then the program will be closed. Board member Clark asked if ISU had any concerns about the allocation of resources needed to develop and implement the proposed MA in Spanish. Dr. Woodworth-Nye responded her office had conducted a separate analysis of the proposal and had no concerns with the resources needed to start the program.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

5. Idaho State University – Master of Science in Computer Science

### **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Critchfield/Westerberg): To approve the request by Idaho State University to add a Master of Science in Computer Science Program as presented in **Attachment 1.** The motion carried 8-0.

Instruction, Research and Student Affairs (IRSA) Committee Chair, Ms. Debbie Critchfield introduced the proposal from Idaho State University (ISU) for a new Master of Science (MS) in Computer Science.

Board member Westerberg asked ISU to address Board staff concerns regarding accreditation by the Accrediting Board for Education and Technology (ABET) for ISU's undergraduate program in computer science. Executive Vice President and Provost for Idaho State University, Dr. Laura Woodworth-Ney responded the undergraduate computer science program is housed in the College of Business that is accredited under a different accrediting body. The College of Business is currently working with ABET to achieve accreditation and ISU has put forward changes in the curriculum that were needed to receive ABET accreditation. Board member Hill commented on the Board's reliance on accreditation as evidence of a program's quality and asks if ISU is confident the quality of instruction and degree will be recognized in the marketplace. Dr. Woodworth-Nye responded in the affirmative. Dr. Clark asked if ABET accreditation would be in place for the undergraduate computer science program prior to students enrolling in the Master of Science computer program. Dr. Woodworth-Nye responded ISU plans to launch the MS program fall 2019 and expects to seek accreditation status for the undergraduate program in fall 2020.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

6. Idaho State University – Master of Science in Clinical Psychopharmacology

#### **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Critchfield/Hill): To approve the request by Idaho State University to add a Master of Science in Clinical Psychopharmacology Program as presented. The motion carried 8-0.

Instruction, Research and Student Affairs (IRSA) Committee Chair, Ms. Debbie Critchfield introduced the proposal from Idaho State University (ISU) for a new Master of Science (MS) in Clinical Psychopharmacology.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

7. Idaho State University – Master of Science in Nutrition with and without Dietetic Internship

### **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Critchfield/Hill): To approve the request by Idaho State University to add a Master of Science in Nutrition as presented. The motion carried 8-0.

#### AND

M/S (Critchfield/Hill): To approve the request by Idaho State University to designate a professional fee of \$3,000 total, in conformance with the program budget submitted to the Board in Attachment 1. The motion carried 8-0.

Instruction, Research and Student Affairs (IRSA) Committee Chair, Ms. Debbie Critchfield introduced the proposal from Idaho State University (ISU) for a new Master of Science (MS) in Nutrition.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

At this time the Board recessed for fifteen minutes, returning at 9:50 am MST.

8. Board Policy III.T. Student Athletes – Second Reading

## **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Critchfield/Hill): To approve the second reading of amendments to Board policy III.T.6, as presented in Attachment 1. The motion carried 8-0.

Instruction, Research and Student Affairs (IRSA) Committee Chair, Ms. Debbie Critchfield introduced the item and reported no changes from the first reading.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

9. State Common Course List

#### **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Critchfield/Atchley): To approve Idaho's Common Course List Effective for the 2019-2020 Academic Year, as presented. The motion carried 8-0.

Instruction, Research and Student Affairs (IRSA) Committee Chair, Ms. Debbie Critchfield introduced the item and reported Board staff, with feedback from the GEM discipline groups, state General Education committee, and the Council on Academic Affairs and Programs (CAAP) compiled the list of shared common course listings. Courses are designed at the 100 or 200 level, GEM stamped at most institutions, and maintain equivalencies across institutions consistent with the Board's Course Transfer website.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

10. Program Enrollment Summary

This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Instruction, Research and Student Affairs (IRSA) Committee Chair, Ms. Debbie Critchfield introduced the item. She then invited the Board's Chief Academic Officer, Dr. Randall Brumfield, to provide an overview of the program enrollment summary to the Board. Dr. Brumfield reported Boise State University Master of Athletic Leadership program, Idaho State University Master of Physician Assistant Studies program and University of Idaho Juris Doctorate Law program offered in Boise, Idaho all met the enrollment and graduation projections indicated on the program proposals submitted in 2012.

Board member Clark requested Board staff conduct an automatic midway review of new programs prior to the conclusion of the six year review period. Dr. Brumfield responded this would be considered by the IRSA committee. Board member Atchley requested a more thorough analysis of the enrollment projections submitted and if the actual enrollment meets the threshold for program viability.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

11. Open Education Resources Timeline Update
This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Instruction, Research and Student Affairs (IRSA) Committee Chair, Ms. Debbie Critchfield introduced the item and reported Board staff has requested guidance from the Board on the definition of "affordability" to assist institutions with their efforts to reduce textbook expenses.

Board member Hill responded with his desire for a clear definition for Open Education Resources (OER) and whether these resources are entirely free or commercial products. Board member Clark commented OER is one tool available to the Board and it is in the Board's best interest to consider additional options for reducing the costs of textbooks whether those options be free, almost free or at significantly reduced costs.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

12. University of Utah – School of Medicine Annual Report
This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Instruction, Research and Student Affairs (IRSA) Committee Chair, Ms. Debbie Critchfield introduced the item and invited the Board's Chief Academic Officer, Dr. Randall Brumfield, to provide an overview of the annual report to the Board.

Dr. Brumfield reported since July 1976, the State Board of Education has had an agreement with the University of Utah School of Medicine (UUSOM) to reserves a specific number of seats for Idaho residents at the in-state tuition and fee rate establishes by UUSOM for residents of Utah. The program provides opportunities for ten Idaho students annually to attend the UUSOM, for a total of forty Idaho students enrolled at any one time in this four-year program. As part of the Board's contract with the UUSOM, the Board receives an annual report providing program information and an overview of the four-year curriculum and clerkships. A copy of the full report has been included in the agenda materials.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

# 13. Lumina Adult Promise Project

This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Instruction, Research and Student Affairs (IRSA) Committee Chair, Ms. Debbie Critchfield introduced the item and invited the Board's Chief Academic Officer, Dr. Randall Brumfield, to provide an update on the Lumina Adult Promise Project.

Dr. Brumfield reported Board staff submitted a grant proposal to the Lumina Foundation to be considered for its "Adult Promise" efforts. In October 2018, Board staff was notified the proposal would be funded in the amount of \$400,000 over a two year period. The award will provide support for several items including the delivery of student advising and educational services for adults through community libraries in ten rural underserved counties. It will also render expense for contracted services with institutions or independent service providers to launch outreach to prospective adult students in partnership with colleges, industry partners, and state and local agencies, and support efforts among faculty to develop a clear and consistent statewide articulation for awarding credit for prior learning and military experience.

Board member Hill shared feedback from his recent attendance at a National Governor's Association Workshop adding there may exist an opportunity for collaboration in the area of Prior Learning Assessment.

There were no additional questions or comments from the board.

14. Complete College America Momentum Pathways Work Plan

## **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Critchfield/Atchley): To adopt the updated Complete College America Game Changers as provided herein and approve the goals identified in the Work Session Tab 2, Attachment 1 prioritization and scale implementation timelines as identified below, and, for remaining goals not identified charge institutions with providing a plan and timeline to the Board at its next regularly scheduled meeting. The motion carried 8-0.

	Priority Level	Implementation Timeline
Goal 2	High	Fall 2021
Goal 5	High	Fall 2021

Instruction, Research and Student Affairs (IRSA) Committee Chair, Ms. Debbie Critchfield introduced the item and reported approval of the motion would prioritize and set a timeline for the goals discussed by the Board during the December 2018 work session.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

## PLANNING, POLICY AND GOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS (PPGA)

3. Idaho Teacher of the Year – Becky Mitchell This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Planning, Policy and Governmental Affairs (PPGA) Committee Chair, Mr. Don Soltman, introduced the item and invited 2018 Idaho Teacher of the Year – Ms. Becky Mitchell, to discuss the areas of success she has experienced during her teaching career.

Ms. Mitchell has shown marked success with her students going on to some form of postsecondary education and shared with the Board her experiences with the Preliminary SAT (PSAT) and Scholastic Assessment Test (SAT) as well as how her students used the senior project model to help them utilize their State Fast Forward funds to prepare for the future.

Board President Clark and Board members thanked Ms. Mitchell for her service to students in Idaho.

There were no questions from the Board.

4. Public School Funding Formula Interim Committee Update This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Planning, Policy and Governmental Affairs (PPGA) Committee Chair, Mr. Don Soltman, introduced the item and invited Board President, Dr. Linda Clark, and Superintendent of Public Instruction, Ms. Sherri Ybarra, to provide an update to the Board.

Dr. Clark reported the proposed funding model is based on a set appropriation that is divided by the final student enrollment count after all weighting and school or district adjustments are applied. School districts have expressed concern with this model, especially how the model would impact the state's largest and smallest districts. Superintendent Ybarra reported there have been additional concerns with how the model could impact funding for the Career Ladder.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

5. Code.org Update This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Planning, Policy and Governmental Affairs (PPGA) Committee Chair, Mr. Don Soltman, introduced the item and then invited the Director of State Government Affairs for Code.org, Ms. Maggie Osorio, to provide an update to the Board.

Ms. Osorio shared with the Board an overview of the Code.org professional learning program and how this program can prepare teachers to teacher computer science at the elementary through high school level.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

6. Idaho STEM Action Center – STEM School Designation Recommendations and STEM Action Center Update

This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

## **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (--/--): To approve the request by the STEM Action Center to designate Galileo STEM Academy and Barbara Morgan STEM Academy in West Ada School District #2, Temple View Elementary School in the Idaho Falls School District #91, and Bingham Academy Charter High School in Blackfoot Idaho with the Idaho STEM designation. This item was returned to the STEM Action Center Board for a formal recommendation. No action was taken by the Board.

Planning, Policy and Governmental Affairs (PPGA) Committee Chair, Mr. Don Soltman, introduced the item and then invited Dr. Angela Hemmingway, Executive Director for the STEM Action Center, to provide the annual update to the Board.

As part of the update, Dr. Hemmingway reported four (4) schools applied for the Idaho STEM School Designation, and all were certified through the AdvancED process: Galileo STEM Academy and Barbara Morgan STEM Academy from the West Ada School District #2, Temple View Elementary in the Idaho Falls School District #91, and Bingham Academy in the Blackfoot School District #55.

Board member Soltman asked if schools with "STEM" in their title are certified through the Idaho STEM School Designation. Dr. Hemingway responded in the negative, adding local control allows for schools to have the word "STEM" in their title, however, schools with the Idaho STEM School Designation must be approved by the Board.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

7. President's Council – Student Mental Health – Mental Health Demands and Resources on Campus

This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Planning, Policy and Governmental Affairs (PPGA) Committee Chair, Mr. Don Soltman, introduced the item and then invited the Presidents from the eight colleges and universities to provide an update to the Board.

Representing the community colleges were President Rick Aman, College of Eastern Idaho; President Jeff Fox, College of Southern Idaho; President Bert Glandon, College of Western Idaho and President Rick MacLennan, North Idaho College. Representing the

four year college and universities were Interim President Martin Schimpf, Boise State University; President Kevin Satterlee, Idaho State University; President Cynthia Pemberton, Lewis-Clark State College and President Chuck Staben, University of Idaho. Each of the eight Presidents then shared with the Board how the growing number of students reporting mental health issues has impacted the resources of their college and university counseling centers.

During the discussion, Idaho State University President, Mr. Kevin Satterlee, requested the Board consider amending Board Policy V.B. – Budget Policies to exclude student health services from the definition of auxiliary enterprises. Auxiliary Enterprises are defined as an enterprise that provides a service to students, faculty, or staff and charges a fee related to but not necessarily equal to the cost of services. Board Policy V.B. states that state appropriated funds cannot be allocated to cover any portion of the operating costs of auxiliary enterprises. A change to this policy would allow the institutions to seek state funds or to use other appropriated funds to enhance student health programs that are directly related to the physical, emotional, and/or mental health of students.

Board member Critchfield reported the Instruction, Research and Student Affairs (IRSA) Committee has been studying the student emotional learning problem to specifically identify the problem and what changes are needed to effect help students in this area.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

8. Idaho State University – Faculty Senate – Constitution

## **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Soltman/Westerberg): To approve the request by Idaho State University to approve the proposed Faculty Senate Constitution as presented in Attachment 1. The motion carried 8-0.

Planning, Policy and Governmental Affairs (PPGA) Committee Chair, Mr. Don Soltman, introduced the item and then invited the President of Idaho State University (ISU), Mr. Kevin Satterlee, to present the item to the Board.

President Satterlee reported the proposed Faculty Senate Constitution for Idaho State University was the result of discussions between the President, faculty, and members of the Faculty Senate on how to best meet the needs of the institution. The proposed faculty senate constitution will establish procedures for shared governance and the process for making recommendations to the President and Provost of Idaho State University.

Board member Atchley complimented ISU and President Satterlee on this major accomplishment and commented approval of the document represents a new day for Idaho State University.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

9. FY2018 Teacher Pipeline Report – Findings and This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Planning, Policy and Governmental Affairs (PPGA) Committee Chair, Mr. Don Soltman, introduced the item and then invited the Educator Effectiveness Program Manager for the Idaho State Board of Education, Ms. Christina Linder, to share the report with the Board.

Ms. Linder reported the key finding of the report is that retention, not production, is the main issue. Of the approximately 1,800 certificates issued annually, 33% do not teach in an Idaho public school. The state's attrition rate remains steady at 10%, compared to 8% nationally, and 67% of the state's attrition rate is made up of teachers leaving the teaching workforce for reasons other than retirement. The attrition rate by region has remained consistent from year to year with Regions IV and VI consistently experiencing higher than average rates of attrition possibly due in part to the rurality of those regions. The number of approvals for alternative authorizations increased 13% from FY17 to FY18 totaling 1.077 teachers, or 5.5% of Idaho's teacher population and is at a level where a red flag is waived with the U.S. Department of Education. Finally, Ms. Linder reported on average, 1,550 teachers leave Idaho public schools each year. Using the lowest replacement cost estimate of \$4,400 per teacher, Idaho districts spend, on average, \$6,820,000 annually to replace teachers lost to attrition. A copy of the full report has been included in the agenda materials.

Board member Soltman asked if the renewed emphasis by Idaho State University (ISU) in Region IV has made a difference with the region's teacher shortage. Ms. Linder responded the College of Southern Idaho (CSI) has done a very good job reaching out to local districts to inform them of the Competency Based Alternative Route available to potential educators however, it is Ms. Linder's belief, the work with ISU and CSI is still in the discussion phase and has not reached a point where an impact can be seen.

Board member Clark asked if there is data available from the time when Idaho had a robust mentoring program. Ms. Linder responded not to her knowledge, adding the next steps for the Educator Pipeline reporting would be to study districts with low attrition rates to see if what they are doing is making a difference.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

10. Educator Preparation Program Quality Performance Measures This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

## **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Soltman/Atchley): I move to accept the pilot year report of Educator Preparation Program Performance, as submitted in Attachment 1 and set the regular December 2019 Board meeting as the deadline for the full report. The motion carried 8-0.

Planning, Policy and Governmental Affairs (PPGA) Committee Chair, Mr. Don Soltman, introduced the item and then invited the Educator Effectiveness Program Manager for the Idaho State Board of Education, Ms. Christina Linder, to provide a summary of the pilot year report. A copy of the full report has been included in the agenda materials.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

11. Educator Evaluation Review – FY2019 Instructional/Pupil Service Staff Evaluation Review – Final Report for the 2017-2018 Academic Year This item was provided in the agenda materials as an information item.

Planning, Policy and Governmental Affairs (PPGA) Committee Chair, Mr. Don Soltman, introduced the item and then invited the Educator Effectiveness Program Manager for the Idaho State Board of Education, Ms. Christina Linder to share the survey findings with the Board. A copy of the full report is included in the agenda materials.

Board member Clark asked if there are consequences for districts who do not participate in the evaluation review. Ms. Linder responded there is not, however, if the district is not compliant then teachers may not be considered as having an evaluation based on the Idaho evaluation framework which would make them ineligible for movement on the Career Ladder.

There were no additional questions or comments from the Board.

12. Accountability Oversight Committee – 2018 Student Achievement Report and Recommendations

Planning, Policy and Governmental Affairs (PPGA) Committee Chair, Mr. Don Soltman, introduced the item and then invited Dr. Roger Stewart, Chair of the Accountability Oversight Committee to present the annual report and recommendations to the Board. Accompanying Dr. Stewart were Ms. Alison Henken, K-12 Accountability and Projects Program Manager with the Office of the State Board of Education, and Ms. Karlynn Laraway, Director of Assessment and Accountability for the Idaho State Department of Education. A copy of the full report has been included in the agenda materials.

There were no questions or comments from the Board.

## **OTHER BUSINESS**

There being no further business, a motion to adjourn was entertained.

## **BOARD ACTION**

M/S (Scoggin/Atchley): To adjourn the meeting at 3:46pm (MST). The motion carried 7-0. Board members Critchfield and Westerberg were absent from voting.